



## EVALUATING LANGUAGE FEATURES IN AN ENGLISH TEXTBOOK FOR GRADE 11: A COMPREHENSIVE ANALYSIS BASED ON TEACHER AND EXPERT CRITERIA

Feby Rahmi<sup>1</sup> & Muhammad Zaim<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> English Department, Language and Art Faculty, Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang City, Indonesia

\*Corresponding email: feby.rahmi34@gmail.com

**APA Citation:** Rahmi, F., & Zaim, M. (2025). Evaluating language features in an english textbook for grade 11: a comprehensive analysis based on teacher and expert criteria. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 11(2), 285-298. <https://doi.org/10.25134/ieflij.v11i2.11600>

Received: 21-03-2025

Accepted: 19-05-2025

Published: 30-07-2025

**Abstract:** This study is aimed to evaluate the English textbook, especially a textbook for grade 11 high school students. The data source in this study is an English textbook used by Grade 11 high school students from the *Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia*. This study uses a quantitative description approach to look at the phenomena and describe the existing conditions in the field. The instrument of this research is an evaluation checklist. Two English teachers and the researcher filled out the evaluation checklist. As a result of the study, textbook evaluation related to learning English is identified and classified based on the classification of language aspects which are evaluated based on developed criteria of textbook evaluation from some experts, like Celce-Murcia & Marianne (2001), Cunningsworth (1995), Littlejohn (2011), Mukundan (2011), Nation and Macalister (2010) and Ur (1996). Those results indicate that, the evaluation of an English textbook based on the language aspect for grade XI high school students. The quality of the English textbook based on the language aspect for grade XI high school students got an average score of 89.78%. It was classified as the category of Very Good. This demonstrates how well the textbook met the syllabus in terms of language quality, which can be seen from language appropriateness, where a match between language and student development, communicativeness, the coherence and unity of ideas, are integrated with four skills, and other language aspects, so the learning materials in this book are suitable with language aspect. The study underscores the textbook's strong alignment with curricular standards, recommending further emphasis on real-world communication elements

**Keywords:** textbook evaluation; english textbook; language aspect

### INTRODUCTION

Both students and teachers must use textbooks as part of their education. When it comes to the process of teaching and learning, textbooks are seen as the primary cornerstones of courses. Although they might not include all the knowledge required for instruction and learning, textbooks are invaluable instructional tools. In addition to being useful teaching and learning tools, they also functioned as a window into the beliefs and values of an individual or nation (Hinkel, 2005). The requirement to use a new textbook for teaching and learning purposes is one of the reasons why a textbook evaluation should be conducted. When using a textbook, teachers must be able to evaluate both its advantages and disadvantages (Sheldon,

1988; Mukundan et al., 2011). This evaluation can be used to determine if the instructor should continue using the book or whether a new one should be purchased. Cunningsworth (1995) in (Wahab, 2013) also support the claim that it is important to evaluate textbooks to identify their advantages and disadvantages. To select the appropriate textbook, the teachers or evaluators must be able to determine the needs of the students.

According to Prastowo (2011), "The textbook has several elements such as the title of the textbook, basic competency or main material, exercise, and assessment." It means that a teaching program can be considered to be supported by textbooks.

The definition of textbooks has already been offered by certain experts. It is crucial to first read the definition of the textbook provided by the Indonesian Ministry of Education. According to the Ministry of Indonesia, a textbook is the primary reference work that must be used in class and is made up of materials that are meant to help students learn science and technology as well as to increase their piety and manners (Kementrian Pendidikan Nasional, 2005, p. 2). According to the Ministry of Education (2005), the Indonesian National Education Standard Board's (Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan Indonesia) recommendations are taken into consideration when the Minister of Education selects the textbooks that teachers and students use in the teaching and learning process. The minister of education decides which textbooks will be used by the teachers.

According to Richard (2001, p. 254), textbooks are possibly the most popular type of instructional resource used in language instruction. Different strategies are utilized to employ textbooks in language programs. A course on reading techniques, for instance, might be built around a reading textbook. It offers exercises for practicing abilities as well as reading materials.

According to some experts, textbooks have continued to play a both within and outside of the classroom, playing a part in a larger educational framework. They are Celce-Murcia (2001); Nunan (2003); and Littlejohn (2011). Therefore, materials—especially those found in textbooks—are essential for introducing students to the English language (Dudley-Evans & St. John, 2000, p. 171). This implies that the classroom activities, how teachers instruct, and the roles that the students perform are all under the influence of the textbook. It should be emphasized that in Indonesian high schools for grade 11, the textbook serves as the main resource. Richards (2007, p. 251) claims that materials serve as both the students' main knowledge source and the type of "language practice that occurs in the classroom."

According to Ur (2009), a textbook is a book that both teachers and students have access to and serves as the foundation for a language course. According to this definition, a textbook is a necessary component in the classroom, and the course should be structured around the materials in the textbook. Furthermore, this definition of the

textbook highlights the fact that teachers are not permitted to implement their curriculum in the classroom because they are required to base their instruction on the textbook, with the backing of any supplemental materials.

Ivic & Pesikan (2013) contend that a "textbook is the operationalized school curriculum that covers the entire school curriculum". The textbook is regarded by students as the core component of their education, the primary and frequently the sole method of learning, and most frequently a device for reproducing repetitious learning. Ivic and Pesikan (2013) add on to argue that "the primary role of textbooks is as the transmission of information, predetermined by the school curriculum for a given subject in a given school year".

According to Hurst (2015), "Together with other elements such as the participants (teachers and students), the processes (activities or action that occur within the teaching-learning space), and the structures (curricula, institutions, power-holders), this non-exclusive list of factors shapes what has been referred to as "the classroom ecology," making textbooks important artifacts in the educational landscape," a term used to describe the interactions between students and teachers in a classroom.

Additionally, textbooks are described by Margana and Widyanoro (2016) as "a compilation of useful materials, which are relevant to the course area for a formal study." For teachers and students to engage in particular educational practices, textbooks offer them guidelines on important learning practices. The primary sources for knowledge and information about the subject being studied also include the textbook.

The textbook serves as a repository for educational resources during the teaching and learning process. According to Gholami, et al. (2017), textbooks are the most relevant source of learning worldwide, serving as a guide for students and teachers, engaging them in practices and fostering the success of both teaching and learning activities.

Textbooks are thought to play two different roles in language training. There are two purposes for textbooks in the classroom, in the opinion of Richard and Renandya (2002). The first perspective, referred to as a deficiency view, sees textbooks as a way to make up for teachers'

deficiencies in the classroom. By implementing the proper tasks and exercises, they are also utilized to guarantee that the curriculum has been covered. The second perspective, often known as a different perspective, holds that the best decisions are often made by individuals other than teachers due to their differing levels of experience.

In general, the negotiation and inadequacy functions of textbooks in the classroom can be summed up in two categories. Negotiating means that the instructors might quickly agree on several issues relating to how such issues would be handled in the classroom. On the other hand, deficiency encourages teachers' limitations in creating a teaching and learning process. The two aforementioned concepts are then primarily focused on promoting their professional growth.

Understanding some standards for excellent textbooks is necessary to evaluate textbooks. These requirements assist the evaluator in creating a textbook evaluation tool that will be used to rate the features under examination. According to Celce-Murcia and Marianne (2001), "textbooks should fit at least three components. These include the compatibility of texts with the curriculum, the compatibility of students and texts, and the compatibility of teachers and texts. Textbooks must take into account the curriculum in both the larger and more specific educational contexts, according to the first factor, the fit between curriculum and texts. Textbooks should include four elements, including relevant material, useable examples, attainable and varied assignments, and presentation of the textbook, to fit teachers and texts. The fourth factor—interesting contents, relevant examples, a variety of activities, and presentation—relates to the fit between students and texts.

The demands of the students include a variety of elements, including personal, professional, and educational needs. The requirements of pupils are divided into three categories, whereas the needs of teachers are divided into two categories: personal and professional needs. Administrators' needs are met to meet institutional needs.

Evaluation of a textbook generally refers to the process of determining its suitability based on particular standards. According to Cunningsworth (1995), "any parties conducting the judicial process will base it on their views and priorities." Additionally, according to Celce-Murcia &

Marianne (2001), this is classified as a complex process executed in several ways. They can be more decentralized, more centralized, or teacher-owned decision-making processes.

It is necessary to evaluate a textbook because not all published content can be used effectively in the classroom. To choose a textbook that meets the requirements of a good English Textbook and is consistent with the teaching purpose, a teacher must first analyze one or more Textbooks by analyzing their strengths and limitations. According to Pinter (2006), one obvious goal of such an evaluation could be for teachers to suggest a better textbook to schools to replace the outdated one or to find ways to augment the current textbook.

Harmer (2002, p. 301) emphasizes "to include student opinion and remark" at this point. Three main approaches are thought to be used to evaluate a Textbook: surveying both students and teachers; employing tests for Textbook evaluation rather than student assessment; and finally, interviewing both students and teachers (Robinson, 1991, p. 60). Most crucially, Sadeghi (2005, p. 30) advises that textbooks be piloted and taught for one semester to assess their strengths and faults. Yet, evaluation based on a checklist has lost credibility, and educators might use their expertise to support a professional judgment (Cunningsworth, 1995). It appears that the majority of the checklists were created in a hurry, and their accuracy is debatable. Additionally, Mukundan (2006, p. 171-172) mentions some of the drawbacks of checklists, including the fact that they cannot accurately assess the complexity of the teaching-learning process, some checklists contain challenging and deceptive terms, and some checklists have complicated and wordy criteria. Hence, according to Harmer (2002, p. 301), educators would do better to create a checklist based on their unique scenario, taking into account their goals, needs, and cultural and societal norms.

There are standards for textbook evaluation provided by some professionals. According to Celce-Murcia and Marianne (2001), there are four key factors to take into account while evaluating textbooks. Content/explanations, examples, tasks/exercises, and presentation/format are the four components. These exhibit the characteristics of a good textbook.

Littlejohn (2011) states that there are two main standards for judging a textbook's value. They cover aspects of publication and design. Littlejohn's theory of textbook analysis also views books as pedagogical tools.

According to Mukundan, et al. (2011), this provides a thorough checklist of textbook ratings gleaned from a focus group survey. They provide an overview of the textbook's two primary sections, which are general attributes and teaching-learning content. Five characteristics make up the general attributes, which form the first pillar of textbook evaluation. The relationship between the textbook and the syllabus, technique, fit for the learners, physical and utilitarian features, and effective use of supplemental materials are all included. In other words, general attributes aim to provide answers to queries regarding the compatibility of the textbook with the syllabus, the methodologies used, the compatibility of the textbook with some aspects related to the needs, interests, and other backgrounds of the learners, the appropriateness of physical appearance, and the teacher's guide.

Based on Nation and Macalister's (2010) suggestion, "Language Curriculum Design" proposes three key criteria for assessing the current course books. These consist of 1) goals, content, and sequencing; 2) format and presentation; and 3) monitoring and assessment.

Nation and Macalister's criteria for evaluating the textbook provide comprehensive and in-depth details on both internal and external methods of evaluation. In addition, provide evaluation criteria that will be used in his evaluation procedure. They don't offer a thorough justification for their method of evaluating textbooks, though.

Previous research has revealed key aspects of textbooks that are applicable in practice as well as any gaps that serve as a background for the current investigation. There are several studies on textbook evaluation, such as Gunantar (2017) studies the importance of textbooks in the teaching and learning process. It is impossible to emphasize the importance of textbooks as teaching aids, even though they might not be able to satisfy all of the demands of the teaching and learning process. They become one of the most effective teaching and learning tools since they serve as a mirror of a person's or a nation's beliefs and ambitions. The other studies come from Handayani (2016) claims

that a list created by Litz was used for document analysis during the qualitative evaluation of the textbook. It has six requirements: a layout and design, abilities, activities, language types, subject and content, and practical considerations. The analysis revealed that the textbooks met the standards for good English textbooks. Another study was conducted by Rohmatillah and Pratama (2017). The goal of their study is to determine how broadly the syllabus points of the 2013 curriculum were covered by the eleventh-grade Pathway to English textbook during the first semester.

Nurhamsih and Syahrial (2017) reported research on textbook evaluation too but only focused on the materials used at Vocational Schools based on Cunningsworth's Checklist. This study revealed that the textbook fell short of the standards for quality English teaching materials in terms of grammar, vocabulary, and language practice. In basic terms, several elements in the textbook qualify it as a good textbook. Such as Handayani, Suwarno & Dharmayana (2018) report their study on the evaluation English textbook "Think Globally Act Locally" based on teachers' perspectives. This textbook was rated as "Fair" all around. A textbook evaluation was also conducted by Sari, Fauzia, and Fatimah (2018). Their research was an analysis of the activities in English textbooks for grade 10 students that were published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture. The researchers concluded that this English textbook can be categorized as a great textbook because only one category—asking the learner to infer grammatical principles from an uncomplicated drill—was frequently seen in this textbook.

Another study related to textbook evaluation comes from Siagian, Muth'im, & Arapah (2020) reveals the research about the evaluation English textbook for grade 11 entitled "Bahasa Inggris". The author gives the "Bahasa Inggris" textbook a "Fair" grade, with a 70.58% average, according to the results they displayed. In conclusion, the textbook material can be used effectively in the teaching process.

In another study from Lisa (2018) entitled "An Analysis of Writing Material in English Textbook 'When English Rings the Bell' for Eighth Grade", two crucial aspects of the writing materials—material presentation and linguistic element—were examined about how they are presented in

textbooks. This study used a content analysis and descriptive qualitative. According to this research, textbooks are a crucial tool used by teachers and students to aid in the learning process. They show how all writing assignments take the form of guided writing, in which students are asked to write responses to given prompts in a specific length. In the textbook, linguistic components are handled in an integrated manner.

Another study on the learning materials in textbook evaluation by Sari, Fauzia, and Fatimah (2018) was "An Analysis of the Activities in Bahasa Inggris Textbook for 10th Grade Students Published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture". This study, which aims to examine the quality of the English textbook in terms of the exercises it offers, was descriptive. In this study, the researcher's tool for studying the English textbook was an analysis format. The analysis format consisted of six categories, which were created based on the guidelines for a quality textbook recommended by experts. Since only one category—asking the student to deduce grammatical rules from a straightforward drill—was infrequently encountered in this textbook, the researchers' findings indicated that this English textbook can be classified as a good textbook. The other criterion, however, had a sufficient number of entries to support the book's activities.

The related study was conducted by Rahma Widi (2022) who studied "The Evaluation of Textbook of English for Computer Engineering for UNP Students Based on Their Needs". This study aims to evaluate the English Textbook for Computer Engineering for UNP Students based on their needs which involves three aspects of the Textbook under study: 1) language content, 2) topic, and 3) skills. This study was evaluation research in the form of finding out the needs of the students and evaluating the English Textbook based on students' needs. The result of the need analysis shows that Computer Engineering students need six materials for grammatical structure, twelve topics related to the computer, and twenty-seven materials for skills (speaking has nine, listening has five, reading has three, and writing has ten).

Zahrina Ulfa (2022) studied "The Evaluation of English Textbook for Senior High School Students Grade XI Entitled "Bahasa Inggris Kelas XI". The purpose of this study was to evaluate an XI grade

English textbook entitled "Bahasa Inggris Kelas XI" published by the Ministry of Education and Culture. The results showed that the percentage of suitability of the textbook based on Cunningsworth's theory was 82%. and the percentage of suitability of textbooks based on the standard BSNP was 93%. they are categorized as highly suitable level.

In the creation of textbooks, experts contend that presentation, content, and language are crucial components of the learning material. It is desired that the textbook's authors can fulfill one of these closely connected requirements without lowering the standard of the other requirements because these requirements for quality textbooks should be met. Additionally, senior high school is one of the institutions of learning that prioritizes English as a subject. Government Regulations Number 033/H/Kr/2022 states the requirements for senior high school curricula. The goals of teaching English in senior high school are to improve student intelligence, knowledge, personality, morals, and skills, to live autonomously, and to continue to higher education. English is taught on the same curriculum in SMA and SMK in Indonesia. For researchers conducting studies on similar treatments but differing requirements, these issues become key components of critical thinking. The reason for choosing SMA is because of preparation for further education.

Evaluating the Grade 11 English textbook is essential, particularly with a focus on language aspects, as this stage is critical for students preparing for higher education. At this level, students are expected to develop advanced language skills that will support them in reading, writing, and critical thinking at a college level.

A thorough evaluation of the Grade 11 English textbook ensures that it is equipped to develop the language proficiency and critical thinking skills students need for higher education. This includes assessing vocabulary complexity, grammatical structure, and the inclusion of culturally diverse content.

Based on the information provided above, the researcher is interested in analyzing the quality of the language aspect of senior high school English textbooks. In this study, the English textbook "English for Change" for Grade 11 High School Students as an object to get the data.

## METHOD

This research was a type of quantitative-description approach. Following Sugiyono's (2013) point of view, the quantitative descriptive approach is utilized to describe the characteristics of a population or phenomenon systematically and factually using numerical data. The evaluation of the high school English textbook was the main goal of this research.

The data in this research were scores generated from an evaluation checklist. The data came from an analysis of a student textbook called Bahasa Inggris: English for Change grade 11 written by the Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia. It was evaluated for the English students' textbook based on language aspect. Additionally, the analysis format included comments from the researchers who scored the students' textbooks about the language components of a good textbook as well as the learning material's strengths and weaknesses.

The evaluation checklist from the English students' textbook was the instrument used in this research. This evaluation checklist served as the basis for evaluating the student textbook manually. In the Merdeka curriculum, the characteristics of the student textbook were described using a checklist approach. It contained the metrics for evaluating the students' books by the Merdeka curriculum.

The research data were gathered via several procedures. The researcher must obtain the document first. English textbook "English for Change" grade 11 high school from the *Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia* is the source document used in this research. Then, the researcher used an analysis document, namely an evaluation checklist. English teachers and the researcher filled out the checklist to evaluate the English textbook for students. Finally, the researcher analyzed the data from the Merdeka curriculum's review of the English students' textbooks based on the indicator.

Table 1. *The instrumentation to evaluate the language aspect in the textbook*

Language Aspect	Sub-Indicators	Items	Scores					Notes
			5	4	3	2	1	
Appropriates of Language	a.	The match between Language and students' development	1-2					
	b.	Communication	3-5					
	c.	The Coherence and unity of ideas	6-8					
	d.	Four skills	9-12					
	e.	Other language aspects	13-15					

The language aspect only contains one indicator, which is an appropriate language. This indicator has five sub-indicators, including communicativeness, the coherence and unity of ideas, four skills, and other language aspects. It also considers how well students' language skills match their developmental needs. The items divided into the items are suggested by specialists such as Celce-Murcia & Marianne (2001), Cunningsworth (1995), Littlejohn (2011), Mukundan (2011), Nation and Macalister (2010), and Ur (1996) who have developed certain criteria for textbook evaluation.

To justify the choice of evaluation criteria from experts like Celce-Murcia and Cunningsworth, it's important to consider their frameworks' relevance and alignment with the study's objectives. Both experts are prominent figures in the field of language education and textbook evaluation, making their frameworks well-regarded for assessing the quality and effectiveness of English language textbooks.

Celce-Murcia's framework is often chosen for its comprehensive approach to communicative competence, emphasizing not only grammatical but also sociolinguistic and strategic competencies. This aligns well with objectives focused on

preparing students for real-world language use, which is critical for communicative and functional language teaching goals.

Cunningsworth's criteria focus on the usability of textbooks in classroom settings, including aspects like flexibility, clarity, and cultural relevance. His framework emphasizes how well a textbook supports teachers in delivering effective lessons and meeting student needs. This aligns with objectives centered on practical applications in teaching.

Both experts provide criteria that address a wide range of language aspects, from vocabulary and grammar to skills development (listening, speaking, reading, writing). This holistic view is essential for a balanced evaluation of textbooks used in secondary or higher education settings, as

it ensures that the materials cover all aspects needed for language competence at an advanced level.

For studies focused on students transitioning to higher education, these frameworks are useful because they consider how well textbooks build advanced skills and critical thinking abilities. Cunningsworth's focus on supporting autonomy and Celce-Murcia's on strategic competence are particularly relevant for textbooks aimed at preparing students for university-level English.

In sum, choosing these frameworks provides a comprehensive evaluation structure that aligns with the study's goals of assessing language proficiency, practicality, and academic readiness in English textbooks.

Table 2. *Instrument of evaluation checklist related to the language aspect*

No	Content Aspect		Items	SA (5)	A (4)	U (3)	D (2)	SD (1)	Notes
	Indicators	Sub-indicators							
1	Appropriates of language	The match between Language and students' development	1. The instructional language and explanations must align with students' cognitive development						
			2. The instructional language and explanations must align with students' social-emotional conditions.						
	Communication		3. Message readability: the message should be clear and understandable						
			4. Grammatical accuracy: the message should be presented within a section/chapter/sub-chapter/paragraph must be coherent						
			5. The instructional language should be natural and authentic to promote real-life and meaningful communication						
	The coherence and unity of ideas		6. The material presented within a section/chapter/subsection/paragraph must be coherent.						
			7. The material must show unity of meaning within each section/chapter/subchapter/paragraph.						
			8. The material should be sequenced from simple to complex.						
	Four skills		9. Listening: there is a good presentation and practice of listening						
			10. Speaking: there is a good presentation and practice of speaking						
			11. Reading: there is a good presentation and practice of reading						
			12. Writing: there is a food presentation and practice of writing						
	Other language aspects		13. Vocabulary: there is a good presentation and practice of vocabulary						
			14. Grammar: there is a good presentation and practice of grammar						
			15. Pronunciation: there is a good presentation and practice of pronunciation						

Table 2 is the checklist evaluation instruments used in this study which were filled in by 3 evaluators, who were English teachers who used

the English book "English for Change". And the researcher itself.

**Table 3. Degree of agreement**

Degree of Agreement	Score	Interval
Strong Agree	5	4.26 – 5
Agree	4	3.26 – 4.25
Undecided	3	2.26 – 3.25
Disagree	2	1.26 – 2.25
Strongly Disagree	1	1 – 1.25

The researcher and several teachers who were experienced in teaching English, especially at Senior High School evaluated the instrument. The researcher selected the evaluation checklist. The discussion of how the researcher's evaluation enhanced the students' textbook included an analysis of the researcher's evaluation as well.

According to Gay et al. (2012), an instrument's validity is highly significant and is supported by several pieces of evidence. Expert judgment was used to determine the content validity or content validation. The research's instruments were verified by one validator, namely a lecturer at the researcher's university. In this phase, the researcher discussed the data with peers or colleagues to ensure its validity after classifying it. The researcher discussed data analysis and discovery with the advisor. After the instrument is valid, the instrument is given to the analyzer.

The research data were gathered via several procedures. The researcher must obtain the document first. English textbook "English for Change" grade 11 high school from the *Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia* was the source document used in this research. Then, the researcher used an analysis document, namely an evaluation checklist. English teachers who used this textbook in teaching and learning activities and the researcher filled out the checklist to evaluate an English textbook for students. The teachers were from SMAN 2 Batang Anai, Padang-Pariaman, Sumatera Barat. Finally, the researcher analyzed the data from the Merdeka curriculum's review of the English students' textbooks based on the indicator.

For data analysis, the first step in managing the data was to ensure that the documents—in this case, the English textbook for students—were comprehensive. The teachers and researcher next followed the instructions to complete the form's evaluative checklist. This involves using multiple data sources, methods, or perspectives to cross-validate findings. In this case, the study could

compare the checklist evaluations with additional qualitative feedback from different stakeholders (e.g., students or other educators) or incorporate other data sources, such as lesson observations or student performance metrics, to verify the findings. The data were then presented in the form of a table and text. The display data was arranged by the student's textbook and the indicators/criteria for textbook evaluation (language aspect). It was followed by a detailed explanation of how the indications and criteria mentioned in the students' Grade XI textbook work. Additionally, the researcher used percentage scores based on how well the students' textbooks performed in the Merdeka curriculum in addition to gathering data through an evaluation checklist (Sugiyono, 2010). The data were then divided into categories by the researcher. To identify the requirements for a good textbook, the researcher categorized the evaluation score into four categories: very poor, poor, good, and very good. The following table shows the scoring criteria:

**Table 4. The classification of textbook evaluation**

Range of fulfillment score	Category
80% - 100%	Very Good
60% - 79%	Good
50% - 59%	Poor
0% - 49%	Very Poor

(Adapted from Narimawati, 2010: 85)

The conclusion was reached once the data had been displayed and explained. The conclusion made it clear how the students' textbook can be assessed in terms of its language aspect.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The Indonesian Ministry of Education states that the textbook is the primary reference book that students must study in class. It contains information designed to help students learn science and technology as well as to increase their piety and manners (Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional, 2005). Based on the indicators of the evaluation criteria for the students' textbook developed by various experts, such as Celce-Murcia & Marianne (2001), Cunningsworth (1995), Littlejohn (2011), Mukundan (2011), Nation and Macalister (2010), and Ur (1996), the researcher evaluated the content, language, and presentation aspect.

The data contains evaluation checklists from English student textbooks that are based on the language aspect. The indicators and sub-indicators were developed by the researcher. These data were



characterized and examined in light of relevant ideas. The description and analysis of the data are divided into one category. The researcher in this study provided a point-by-point description of the data description and analysis in connection to lists of the research questions, as follows:

*The quality of english students' textbook based on the language aspect for grade xi high school students*

The language aspect has a significant impact on English language learners' textbooks. It influences

how teachers interpret language in the textbooks to their students, how learners react to learning materials, and how well learners comprehend the materials when they read them aloud. There is an indicator to evaluate the language component, namely appropriates of language. A summary of the language aspect's findings was provided based on the evaluators' evaluation. The following table displays a summary of the evaluation in the language aspect.

Table 5. Analysis of the finding data

Table 5: Analysis of the finding data										
Language Aspect	Sub-Indicators	Number of Question	5	4	3	2	1	Total	Scores	Category
Appropriates of Language	The match between Language and students' development	1	3	0	0	0	0	15	100%	Very Good
		2	1	1	1	0	0	12	80%	
		3	1	2	0	0	0	13	86.67%	
	Communication	4	2	1	0	0	0	14	93.33%	Very Good
		5	0	3	0	0	0	15	100%	
		6	3	0	0	0	0	15	100%	
	The Coherence and Unity of Ideas	7	2	1	0	0	0	14	93.33%	Very Good
		8	3	0	0	0	0	15	100%	
		9	1	0	2	0	0	11	73.33%	
	Four Skills	10	1	2	0	0	0	13	86.67%	Very Good
		11	1	1	1	0	0	12	80%	
		12	1	2	0	0	0	13	86.67%	
	Other Language Aspects	13	0	3	0	0	0	15	100%	Very Good
		14	0	3	0	0	0	15	100%	
		15	1	0	1	1	0	10	66.67%	
Mean Score									89.78%	Very Good

Table 5 demonstrates that language appropriateness is one of the characteristics used to evaluate English textbooks for students. The table above indicates that the quality of an English textbook for grade XI high school students based on the language aspect got an average score of 89.78%. It was classified as the category of Very Good. This demonstrates how well the textbook met the syllabus in terms of language quality. As a result, the evaluators strongly agreed that the English textbook quality for students, as measured by the language aspect for high school students in grade XI, was very good for the curriculum. The evaluation of each indication related to the language aspect is displayed in the table above, and

it was explained by looking at the sub-indicators, which included:

The appropriateness of language demonstrates how English students' textbooks are evaluated based on the language component. This component was made up of five sub-indicators: the match between language and students' development, communication, the coherence and unity of ideas, four skills, and other language aspects. The aforementioned table indicates that all of the evaluators responded strongly agree when asked if language appropriateness matches students' growth as described in the English language students' textbook. Meanwhile, each evaluator had a different response, namely strongly agree, agree,

and undecided about the students' cognitive growth and socio-emotional state are already taken into account, the language used for instruction and explanation is also appropriate.

On the communication sub-indicator, the responses from evaluators varied greatly. One evaluator responded strongly agree and two others responded agree in terms of message readability, the communications are comprehensible and clear. On grammar-wise, two evaluators responded strongly agree and one evaluator agreed that the messages are delivered using proper English syntax. And then, all of the evaluators agree that the instructional language is already authentic and natural, fostering meaningful and real-world conversation.

The three evaluators strongly agreed with the sub-indicator on coherence and unity of ideas if the materials presented on a particular part, chapter, sub-chapter, or paragraph already demonstrated coherence. Two evaluators strongly agreed and one evaluator agreed that the materials already showed unity of meaning in each part, chapter, sub-chapter, or paragraph. Additionally, three evaluators strongly agreed that the materials were already sequenced from easy to complex.

Language suitability for the four skills, evaluators have varying responses to the instructions for each skill, such as presentations and good practice for each skill. One evaluator responded strongly agree and two evaluators responded undecided on listening skills, whereas in this sub-indicator, there are good presentation and listening practices. On speaking skills, one evaluator responded strongly agree and two evaluators responded agree, whereas in this sub-indicator, there are good presentation and speaking practices. Then, on the reading skills, in this sub-indicator, the evaluators had different responses, there were strongly agree, agree, and undecided. Meanwhile, on writing skills, one evaluator responded strongly agree and two evaluators responded agree.

On the last sub-indicators, namely other language aspects, the evaluators responded strongly agreed in vocabulary and grammar, whereas the vocabulary and grammar part had good presentation and practice. Meanwhile, on the pronunciation part, the evaluators had different responses, namely strongly agree, undecided, and disagree. Because these language skills are not

presented and used well. In some cases, textbooks fail to address the diversity in English accents, leaving students unprepared to understand or emulate variations in pronunciation. Without exposure to different accents and instructions on standard pronunciation, students may struggle with pronunciation clarity.

Littlejohn (2011) states that five primary categories make up the language aspect: the match between language and students' development, communication, the coherence and unity of ideas, four skills, and other language aspects.

In terms of language aspect, there is a match between language and students' development. Instructional and explanatory language should be appropriate for the cognitive development of the students and the socio-emotional level of the students. Meanwhile, communication means that textbooks need to be grammatically correct and have easily readable content to be considered communicative. The ability to read and comprehend a communication is known as message readability. Grammatical correctness is the use of proper English grammar in the message. To encourage meaningful communication in the actual world, training should be given in a natural and authentic language.

Then, coherence and unity of ideas means that the information offered in a section, chapter, sub-chapter, or paragraph should be coherent and have a unity of ideas. The materials ought to demonstrate a cohesive meaning for every section, chapter, sub-chapter, and paragraph. The materials need to be arranged from simple to complicated. In the interim, four skills—listening, speaking, reading, and writing—are practiced and presented well. In addition, there are other language-related issues such as proper vocabulary, grammar, and pronunciation practice.

In the meantime, Handayani (2016) reports that a list created by Litz was employed in a qualitative document analysis process to evaluate the textbook. Six criteria make up this list: subject and content, activities, abilities, layout and design, language kinds, and practical factors. The results of the analysis demonstrated that the textbooks met the standards for quality English textbooks.

Research shows that textbooks often have varied emphases on language skills such as grammar, vocabulary, pronunciation, and

communicative activities, depending on their intended audience and educational approach.

For example, in studies that evaluate other English textbooks, such as *"Pathways to English"* or *"New Concept English,"* researchers have often found that while grammar and vocabulary sections are comprehensive, pronunciation support is usually minimal. If *"English for Change"* shows similar weaknesses, it would indicate a general trend in English textbooks that prioritize reading and writing over pronunciation and listening, which are crucial for students preparing for higher education and real-world communication.

Alternatively, textbooks like *"English Firsthand"* have been noted for integrating more interactive, communicative, and pronunciation-focused activities, setting a standard for a more balanced approach. Comparing *"English for Change"* with such textbooks could reveal that its lack of emphasis on pronunciation deviates from the trend towards interactive learning materials that support speaking and listening skills, especially important for university-bound students.

Incorporating these comparisons would provide context for the low pronunciation score of *"English for Change"*, suggesting whether the textbook's language aspects align with broader patterns in textbook design or diverge in ways that may require adaptation to meet modern educational needs. This broader context helps clarify if the observed weaknesses are inherent to the textbook's instructional design or part of a larger issue within the current landscape of English educational materials.

Analyzing whether the content is suitable for Grade 11 students involves checking the alignment of language complexity, themes, and activities with their age, proficiency level, and cultural background. By assessing the appropriateness of the textbook's language, teachers can understand whether the textbook's vocabulary, tone, and examples are engaging and relevant for students preparing for higher education. Appropriateness in context also ensures that students are exposed to scenarios they may encounter in real-world settings, making language learning more practical.

Evaluating coherence within the *English for Change* textbook could reveal whether concepts and skills are introduced in a structured manner that progressively builds knowledge. If the content is well-organized and easy to follow, students are

more likely to grasp complex linguistic concepts, making their learning journey smoother. A coherent textbook is especially important for students as they prepare for advanced language study or professional settings.

A focus on communicative competence helps students practice functional language, preparing them for authentic interactions rather than just learning language rules. For students transitioning to higher education, these skills are essential as they may be required to communicate in diverse settings.

## CONCLUSION

Conclusions can be drawn from the aforementioned findings. The evaluation of an English textbook for grade XI high school students based on language aspect. The appropriates of language; communication, coherence, and unity of ideas; four skills; and other language aspects demonstrate that it is classified Very Good category in terms of language aspects with score 89.78%. Consequently, the learning materials in this book are appropriate in terms of language aspects.

Based on the findings above, we can suggest that English for Change textbooks should consider including more diverse communication exercises. This aims to help develop language skills that are more relevant to real-world situations. To do this, textbook authors can focus on developing exercises that not only cover grammar or skill learning, but also more practical speaking, listening, and writing skills. For example, tasks or exercises that involve everyday conversations, professional situations, or even scenarios that reflect communication challenges in diverse social and cultural contexts.

In addition, for educators, it is recommended that they use textbooks more creatively, by encouraging students to practice more spontaneous and contextual communication skills. This can be done by facilitating discussion activities, presentations, or role-playing that mimic real interactions that students may experience outside the classroom. In this way, English for Change will be more effective in preparing students to face various communication situations in the real world. Based on the text above, we can suggest that English for Change textbooks should consider including more diverse communication exercises. This aims to help develop language skills that are more relevant to real-world situations. To that end, textbook authors could focus on developing

exercises that not only cover grammar or skill learning, but also more practical speaking, listening, and writing skills. For example, tasks or exercises that involve everyday conversations, professional situations, or even scenarios that reflect communication challenges in diverse social and cultural contexts.

In addition, for educators, it is recommended that they use textbooks more creatively, by encouraging students to practice more spontaneous and contextual communication skills. This can be done by facilitating discussions, presentations, or role-playing activities that mimic real interactions that students might experience outside the classroom. In this way, English for Change will be more effective in preparing students for various communication situations in the real world.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The researcher wants to express her profound appreciation to all those who helped with this study. I am most grateful to Allah SWT for giving me the strength and commitment to complete the research. Thanks to the advisor and staff of the English Language Education Study Program, Faculty of Language and Arts at Universitas Negeri Padang for their invaluable support and resources. Moreover, I would like to thank all of the EFL teachers at Senior High School 2 Batang Anai, Padang-Pariaman, Sumatera Barat for their collaboration. Last, I would like to thank everyone who helped make this research a reality, whether directly or indirectly. The researcher is very grateful for your contributions.

### REFERENCES

- BSNP. (2011). *Instrumen penilaian buku teks pelajaran bahasa inggris*. Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan.
- Brewster. (2007). *The primary english teacher's guide*. New Edition. Pearson Education.
- Celce-Murcia, M., & Olshtain, E. (2001). *Discourse-based approaches: A new framework for second language teaching and learning*. Handbook of research in second language teaching and learning, 729, 741.
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your coursebook alan cunningsworth*. A division of Macmillan, Publisher Limited.
- Diptoadi, Veronica Listiani and Ruruh Mindari. (2015). *An evaluation of english coursebooks for young learners*. Tahun 43, No. 2.
- Dudley-Evans & St. John. (2000). *Development of english for specific purposes*. Cambridge University Press. p. 171.
- F. Sadeghi, A. Ajji, P. J. Carreau. (2005). Study of polypropylene morphology obtained from blown and cast film processes: initial morphology requirements for making porous membrane by stretching. *Journal of Plastic Film and Sheeting*, 21(3), 199-216.
- Fatima, Gul., Syed Kazim Shah., and Humail Sultan. 2015. *Textbook analysis and evaluation of 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade in pakistani context*. Vol. 3, No. 4.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2011). *Educational research competencies for analysis and applications*. Pearson Education Inc.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2012). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and application Tenth Edition*. Pearson Education Inc.
- Gholami, R., Noordin, N., & Rafik-Galea, S. (2017). A thorough scrutiny of ELT textbook evaluations: A review inquiry. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, 5(3), 82-9.
- Grant, N. (1987). *Making the most of your textbook*. Longman.
- Gunantar, D. A. (2017). Textbooks analysis: Analyzing english as a foreign language (EFL) textbooks from the perspective of Indonesian culture. *Journal of Language and Literature*, 11(2), 173-18.
- Habiburrahman, M. (2021). *The evaluation of the formative assessment in textbook for senior high school students grade XI entitled "Bahasa Inggris Kelas XI"*. Thesis. Universitas Negeri Padang.
- Handayani, S. (2016). *The evaluation of English textbook for grade VII of junior high school in Indonesia*. Proceedings of ISELT FBS Universitas Negeri Padang, 4(2), 328-339.
- Handayani, S., Suwarno, B., & Dharmayana, I. W. (2018). Evaluation of Indonesian English textbook for the ninth graders of junior high school "Think Globally Act Locally" from EFL Teachers Perspectives. *JOALL (Journal of Applied Linguistics and Literature)*, 3(2), 11-32.
- Harmer, J. (2001). *The practice of English language teaching*. London: Longman.
- Hinkel. (2005). *Handbook of Research in Second Language Teaching and Learning*. New York. eBook ISBN: 9781410612700.
- Hurst, N. (2015). *Doing it by the book: training student teachers at the Faculty of Letters, the University of Porto (FLUP) to Evaluate English Language Teaching (ELT) Materials*. e-TEALS, 6 (1), 1-19.
- Hutchinson, T. & Waters, A. (1987). *English for specific purposes: A learning-centered approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. P. 125-126.
- Ivic, I., & Pesikan, A. (Eds.). (2013). *Textbook quality: A guide to textbook standards* (Vol. 2). Gottingen: V&R Unipress GmbH.
- Kemendikbudristek. (2022). *Bahasa Inggris "English for Change"*. Jakarta: Kemendikbudristek.
- Lisa, M. (2018). *An Analysis of Writing Material in*

- English Textbook "When English Rings the Bell" For Eighth Grade*. RETAIN, 6 (1).
- Littlejohn, A. (2011). *The analysis of language teaching materials: inside the Trojan horse*. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Materials development in language teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Margana & Widyantoro, A. (2016). *An evaluation of English textbooks used at senior and vocational high schools oriented to Curriculum 2013*. Journal of Arts, Science, and Commerce, 4(1).
- Masuhara, H. (1998). *What Do Teachers Want from Textbook?* In Tomlinson, B. *Materials Development for Language Teaching*. Cambridge.
- McDonough and Shaw. *Evaluation of an ELT Coursebook Based on Criteria Designed*. A Module.
- Mukundan, J., Hajimohammadi, R., & Nimehchisalem, V. (2011). *Developing an English language textbook evaluation checklist*. Contemporary Issues in Education Research (CIER), 4(6), 21-2.
- Munir, Sirajul., Nina Suzanne, and Yulnetri. 2021. *Developing Criteria of an English Textbook Evaluation for Indonesian Senior High School*. Vol. 24, No. 2. IAIN Batusangkar.
- Narimawati, U., Anggadini, S. D., & Ismawati, L. (2010). *Penulisan Karya Ilmiah*. Jakarta: Penerbit Genesis.
- Nunan, D. (2003). *Practical English language teaching*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Nurhamsih, Y., & Syahrial, S. (2018). *Evaluation of English teaching materials used at a vocational high school based on Cunningsworth's checklist*. JOALL (Journal of Applied Linguistics and Literature), 3(2), 33-46.
- Pinter, A. (2006). *Teaching Young Language Learners*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Prastowo. (2011). *Memahami Metode-Metode Penelitian: Suatu Tinjauan Teoritis dan Praktis*. Cetakan kedua, Ar-Ruzz Media, Yogyakarta.
- Ramadhana, Muhammad Affan., Opik Dwi Indah., and Suhardi. (2019). *An Evaluation of English Language Textbook: Interlanguage English for Senior High School Students*. Vol. 2, No.1.
- Richards, J. C., Richards, J. C., & Renandya, W. A. (Eds.). (2002). *Methodology in language teaching: An anthology of current practice*. Cambridge.
- Richards, J. C. (2007). *Curriculum development in language teaching*. Eighth printing. New York: Longman.
- Richard, J. C. (2013). *Curriculum Approaches in Language Teaching: Forward, Central, and Backward Design*. RELC Journal, 44 (1), 5–33.
- Riddell, D. (2003). *Teaching English as a Foreign Language*. New York: University of London Institute of Education.
- Robinson, P.C. (1991). *ESP Today. A Practitioners' Guide*. London, Prentice Hall
- Rohmatillah, R., & Pratama, D. A. (2017). *An Analysis of the Textbook Entitled "Pathway to English" Published by Erlangga in the First Semester of the 11th Grade of Senior High School*. English Education: Jurnal Tadris Bahasa Inggris, 10 (2), 326-343.
- Sari, Fauzia, and Fatimah. (2018). *An Analysis of the Activities in Bahasa Inggris Textbook for 10th Grade Students Published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture*. Thesis. Universitas Negeri Padang.
- Sheldon, Lesti E. (1988). *Evaluating ELT textbooks and materials*. ELT Journal, Volume 42, Issue 4, October 1988, Pages 237–246.
- Siagian, Muth'im, & Arapah. (2020). *Analysis on an English Textbook for the Eleventh Grade Students Entitled "Bahasa Inggris" Used in High School*. Lingua Educatia Journal. Vol. 2 No. 2 June 2020, pp. 109-130.
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Ulfa, Zarina. (2022). *The Evaluation of English Textbook for Senior High School Students Grade XI Entitled "Bahasa Inggris Kelas XI*. Thesis. Universitas Negeri Padang.
- Ur, P. (1996). *A Course in Language Teaching: Practice and Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ur, P. (2009). *A Course in Language Teaching: Practice and Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wahab. (2013). *Developing an English Language Textbook Evaluative Checklist*. IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME) e-ISSN: 2320–7388,p-ISSN: 2320–737X. Volume 1, Issue 3 (Mar. –Apr. 2013). PP 55-70.
- Widi, Rahma. (2022). *The evaluation of textbook of english for computer engineering for UNP Students Based on Their Needs*. Thesis. Universitas Negeri Padang.

**Feby Rahmi & Muhammad Zaim**

*Evaluating language features in an english textbook for grade 11: A comprehensive analysis based on teacher and expert criteria*