

A COMPARATIVE REVIEW OF ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS FOR TENTH-GRADE STUDENTS 'BAHASA INGGRIS: WORK IN PROGRESS' AND 'ENGLISH IN MIND BOOK 3'

Homanfil Atori Nurislami Wilma¹, Desvalini Anwar²

^{1, 2}English Education Department, Master Program Faculty Languages and Arts Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, Indonesia

*Corresponding email: atoripadang2018@gmail.com

APA Citation: Wilma, H. A. N., & Anwar, D. (2025). A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 11(2), 275-284. https://doi.org/10.25134/ieflj.v11i2.11773

Received: 21-03-2025	Accepted: 29-05-2025	Published: 30-07-2025
Abstract: This study evaluates E	nglish textbooks used in Indonesian high scho	ols to determine their alignment
with curriculum standards and the	ir effectiveness in supporting language acquis	sition. Using document analysis,
textbooks were assessed based	on key criteria, including aims and approa	ches, design and organization,
language content, skills developm	ent, topics and cultural representation, and pra	actical considerations. A Likert-
scale rating (1–4) was applied to	quantify evaluation results. The findings high	hlight strengths and weaknesses
in locally produced textbooks c	ompared to internationally published mater	ials, emphasizing the need for
improvements in cultural inclusiv	ity, skills integration, and real-life applicabili	ity. The results provide valuable
insights for educators, curriculun	n developers, and policymakers in selecting a	and enhancing English learning
	serves as a reference for future research on the	
in adapting global materials to loc	al educational contexts. By identifying gaps a	and providing recommendations,
this research contributes to the co	ontinuous development of high-quality textbo	ooks that align with national and
	improving English language education in In-	
Keywords: textbook evaluation	; english language learning; curriculum a	lignment; language education;
educational resources.		

INTRODUCTION

Textbooks serve as essential resources in English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classrooms, providing structured content that aligns with curriculum standards and learning objectives. They function as primary instructional tools that facilitate teachers in delivering lessons while guiding students in acquiring language skills. As emphasized by Marhamah (2024), a wellstructured textbook ensures effective learning by presenting systematic, comprehensible, and engaging materials. However, the effectiveness of a textbook depends on multiple factors, including content quality, design, alignment with learning objectives, and accessibility to learners of diverse proficiency levels.

In Indonesia, the Ministry of Education, examined how textbooks serve as essential Culture, Research, and Technology regulates teaching tools in formal education settings and English language instruction in high schools influence students' comprehension of key concepts through curriculum guidelines. The selection of (Ayu, 2020; Fitriyani et al., 2021; Alkin et al.,

textbooks must align with national standards, ensuring that learning materials support students' cognitive, linguistic, and communicative competencies (Hidayah, 2020). However, the availability of various textbooks from both domestic and international publishers raises questions about their suitability for Indonesian learners. Consequently, comparative analyses are essential in evaluating how well textbooks meet the curriculum's objectives and facilitate effective English language acquisition.

Textbook evaluation has been widely discussed in the field of English language teaching, emphasizing various aspects such as content quality, alignment with curriculum standards, and language appropriateness. Previous studies have examined how textbooks serve as essential teaching tools in formal education settings and influence students' comprehension of key concepts (Ayu, 2020; Fitriyani et al., 2021; Alkin et al.,

A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3

2024; Mulyasa, 2023; Tomlinson, 2023). Some researchers have highlighted that textbooks play a crucial role in developing students' linguistic proficiency and cognitive skills by providing structured and systematic learning materials (Blair, 2023; Balmer & Richards, 2022; Li et al., 2020; Hidayat et al., 2024; Larasati, 2022). The importance of an effective textbook selection process, guided by established evaluation criteria, is also emphasized to ensure that the material meets students' learning needs and institutional objectives (Mustafa, 2021; Mithans & Grmek, 2020; Moris et al., 2020; Nartin et al., 2024; Alfarisy, 2021).

Several studies have compared different textbooks based on evaluation frameworks such as Cunningsworth's criteria and national curriculum guidelines. Research findings indicate that government-issued textbooks often emphasize national identity and cultural elements, whereas internationally published books incorporate a broader range of topics and methodologies (Nainggolan & Wirza, 2021; Ayu, 2020; Putri & Priyanti, 2023; Shi, 2024; Yonata & Yoniswan, 2021). In Indonesia, textbooks published by the Ministry of Education are often designed to align with national education goals, but they may lack some communicative language teaching elements found in globally recognized books (Java et al., 2023; Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022; Quintão et al., 2020; Qurniati et al., 2022; Suri et al., 2024). This difference in approach has been noted in previous comparative studies that analyze how different textbooks cater to students' engagement and practical language use (Sasaghapu et al., 2022; Sakti et al., 2023; Solangi & Memon, 2020: Waruwu, 2024: Wahana, 2023).

Many studies suggest that English textbooks must balance linguistic accuracy, communicative competence, and cultural relevance to be effective for language learning (Dwidarti & Yuliasari, 2024; Hidayah, 2020; Mezmir, 2020; Suri et al., 2024; Peel, 2020). Some researchers argue that textbooks should not only present linguistic structures but also integrate real-world communication skills and problem-solving exercises (Mithans & Grmek, 2020; Marhamah et al., 2024; Mustafa, 2021; Mulyasa, 2023; Shi, 2024). Others highlight that textbooks should incorporate a variety of assessment methods, including both formative and summative evaluations, to measure students' progress effectively (Blair, 2023; Alkin et al.,

2024; Sakti et al., 2023; Tomlinson, 2023; Waruwu, 2024).

Research on textbook evaluation has also explored the integration of multimodal learning resources, such as interactive digital tools, to enhance student engagement (Simamora & Oktaviani, 2020; Damayanti & Kristiantari, 2022; Balmer & Richards, 2022; Nainggolan & Wirza, 2021; Li et al., 2020). Scholars emphasize that the inclusion of multimedia elements in textbooks, such as audio recordings and visual illustrations, supports students' comprehension and language retention (Shi, 2024; Yonata & Yoniswan, 2021; Mustafa, 2021; Alfarisy, 2021; Larasati, 2022). Furthermore, digital textbook formats provide opportunities for self-paced learning and personalized instruction, which can be beneficial in diverse learning contexts (Peel, 2020; Simamora & Oktaviani, 2020; Waruwu, 2024; Mithans & Grmek, 2020; Wahana, 2023).

The role of cultural representation in English textbooks has been another significant area of research. Studies indicate that textbooks should reflect diverse cultural perspectives to help learners develop cross-cultural communication skills (Hidayat et al., 2024; Blair, 2023; Ayu, 2020; Alkin et al., 2024; Moris et al., 2020). However, some textbooks, particularly those developed for national education systems, may prioritize local cultural content over global perspectives, which can limit students' exposure to authentic English international settings (Kementerian use in Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022; Nainggolan & Wirza, 2021; Li et al., 2020; Fitriyani et al., 2021; Dwidarti & Yuliasari, 2024). Comparative studies have analyzed the balance between local and global content in textbooks to determine their effectiveness in preparing students for real-world communication (Tomlinson, 2023; Wahana, 2023; Quintão et al., 2020; Marhamah et al., 2024; Balmer & Richards, 2022).

Another key aspect in textbook evaluation is the inclusion of critical thinking and problem-solving components. Studies suggest that textbooks should not merely provide language rules but also encourage students to think critically and apply their language skills in meaningful contexts (Putri & Priyanti, 2023; Shi, 2024; Larasati, 2022; Ayu, 2020; Mezmir, 2020). Some textbooks include inquiry-based activities and project-based learning to foster analytical skills among students (Qurniati et al., 2022; Waruwu, 2024; Simamora & Oktaviani, 2020; Sakti et al., 2023; Balmer & Richards, 2022). A comparative analysis of various textbooks has shown that those incorporating higher-order thinking activities are more effective in improving students' language competence and engagement (Tomlinson, 2023; Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022; Mulyasa, 2023; Alfarisy, 2021; Mithans & Grmek, 2020).

Some research has explored the gender and social representations in English textbooks, emphasizing the importance of inclusivity and equal representation of different groups (Yonata & Yoniswan, 2021; Hidayat et al., 2024; Mustafa, 2021; Fitriyani et al., 2021; Alkin et al., 2024). Textbooks should avoid stereotypes and instead promote gender equality and social diversity (Moris et al., 2020; Mezmir, 2020; Qurniati et al., 2022; Simamora & Oktaviani, 2020; Suri et al., 2024). Research findings indicate that textbooks incorporating diverse representations positively impact students' perceptions of social issues and inclusivity (Shi, 2024; Blair, 2023; Nainggolan & Wirza, 2021; Damayanti & Kristiantari, 2022; Larasati, 2022).

In general, textbook evaluation studies highlight the need for a comprehensive assessment framework that considers content quality, language accuracy, cultural representation, multimodal resources, and pedagogical effectiveness (Tomlinson, 2023; Jaya et al., 2023; Nainggolan & Wirza, 2021; Alfarisy, 2021; Sakti et al., 2023). Future research should continue to explore how textbooks can be adapted to meet the evolving needs of students in different educational settings while ensuring alignment with global standards (Blair, 2023; Moris et al., 2020; Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022; Quintão et al., 2020; Waruwu, 2024).

Although several studies have evaluated English textbooks used in Indonesian schools, few comparative analyses focus on the alignment of internationally published books with Indonesia's national curriculum standards. Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress (2022), published by the Ministry of Education, is designed for Indonesian learners, whereas English in Mind Book 3: Second Edition is an internationally recognized textbook published by Cambridge University Press. The key research gap lies in the lack of direct comparisons between locally produced and internationally published textbooks in terms of their effectiveness, content appropriateness, and curriculum alignment.

This study aims to answer the following research questions: (1) How do Bahasa Inggris:

Work in Progress (2022) and English in Mind Book 3: Second Edition compare in terms of aims and approaches, design and organization, language content, skills development, topics, and practical considerations? (2) How do these textbooks align with the criteria set by the Indonesian education curriculum, particularly in terms of content feasibility, linguistic appropriateness, presentation feasibility, and graphical elements? (3) Based on the comparative analysis, which textbook better meets the needs of Indonesian tenth-grade high school students?

This research contributes to the field by providing a comparative study of an Indonesian government-published textbook and an internationally recognized English textbook. Unlike previous studies that focused on singletextbook evaluations, this study applies a dualcombining framework approach, Alan Cunningsworth's (1995) criteria with the Indonesian education curriculum assessment standards. This approach offers a comprehensive analysis, allowing educators to make informed decisions when selecting textbooks for high school students.

This study benefits educators by guiding textbook selection to align with the national curriculum and enhance student learning (Ayu, 2022). 2020; Akhmad et al., Curriculum developers gain insights to improve Indonesian textbooks, ensuring competitiveness with global materials (Alkin et al., 2024; Blair, 2023). Future research can build on this work to explore textbook adaptation and digital integration (Damayanti & Kristiantari, 2022; Li et al., 2020). Policymakers receive recommendations for refining textbook selection, ensuring quality and alignment with standards (Jaya et al., educational 2023; Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022). Ultimately, this study bridges theory and practice, supporting continuous textbook evaluation for effective English language teaching (Mustafa, 2021; Waruwu, 2024).

METHOD

This study employs a qualitative research design, focusing on a comparative analysis of two English textbooks: Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress (2022) and English in Mind Book 3: Second Edition. Qualitative research is well-suited for understanding textual materials, particularly in evaluating the content, structure, and instructional value of textbooks (Mezmir, 2020). The study follows a descriptive evaluative approach to assess

A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3

established evaluation criteria (Robinson, 2024).

The primary data sources are two English textbooks designed for tenth-grade high school students: (1) Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress (2022), published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture. (2) English in Mind Book 3: Second Edition, published by Cambridge University Press.

The evaluation criteria are derived from Alan Cunningsworth's (1995) framework for textbook assessment and the Educational Curriculum Assessment Standards Board (Gyamtso, 2020). These criteria provide a structured approach to determining the textbooks' effectiveness in achieving pedagogical objectives.

This study employs document analysis to systematically evaluate textbooks based on key

the suitability of both textbooks based on criteria aligned with national curriculum standards. The evaluation framework includes aims and approaches, ensuring alignment with educational goals; design and organization, assessing content structure and clarity; language content, examining vocabulary and grammar appropriateness; and skills development, evaluating the balance of listening, speaking, reading, and writing activities. Additionally, topics and cultural representation are analyzed for relevance and inclusivity, while practical considerations assess accessibility and usability in classrooms. A Likert-scale rating (1 =Poor to 4 = Excellent) quantifies the evaluation, ensuring objective comparison. This combined qualitative and quantitative approach provides a structured. reliable assessment of English textbooks.

Idole 1. Evaluation chiefta for English lexibook analysis				
Evaluation Criteria	Description	Rating Scale (1–4)		
Aims and Approaches	Assesses how well the textbook aligns with	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
	curriculum goals and teaching methodologies.	Good, $4 = Excellent$		
Design and Organization	Evaluates layout, sequence, and clarity of	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
	instructional flow.	Good, $4 = Excellent$		
Language Content	Examines vocabulary, grammar, and	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
	appropriateness for proficiency levels.	Good, $4 = Excellent$		
Skills Development	Analyzes balance between listening, speaking,	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
	reading, and writing activities.	Good, $4 = Excellent$		
Topics and Cultural	Assesses relevance, diversity, and inclusivity of	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
Representation	cultural and social contexts.	Good, $4 = Excellent$		
Practical Considerations	Reviews availability, affordability, and ease of	1 = Poor, 2 = Adequate, 3 =		
implementation in classrooms.		Good, $4 = Excellent$		

Table 1. Evaluation criteria for English textbook analysis

qualitative analysis following the framework outlined by Saputra (2020): Data Reduction -Relevant textbook content is categorized according to the evaluation criteria. Data Display – Findings are presented in tables and descriptive summaries for comparative interpretation. Conclusion Drawing and Verification - The comparative results are synthesized to determine which textbook aligns best with instructional goals (Mezmir, 2020; Tomlinson, 2023).

To ensure validity and reliability, the study adopts triangulation by comparing multiple data sources and applying standardized evaluation criteria. The checklist is validated by English language education experts to confirm its suitability for evaluating English textbooks (Mulyasa, 2023). Additionally, inter-rater reliability is established by having multiple RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The collected data undergo a three-step evaluators independently assess the textbooks, followed by a comparison of their ratings (Quintão, 2020).

> This study strictly adheres to ethical research principles, ensuring that the evaluation process remains objective and unbiased. All data are analyzed in compliance with academic integrity standards (Mezmir, 2020). Since the study focuses on publicly available educational materials, no human participants are involved, thus eliminating the need for informed consent (Blair, 2023).

> By employing this methodological framework, the study aims to produce a comprehensive and objective evaluation of Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress and English in Mind Book 3: Second Edition, assisting educators in selecting the most effective instructional materials.

Textbook quality and cultural representation

One of the crucial aspects of a textbook is its quality and the extent to which it represents cultural elements. Ayu (2020) emphasizes that cultural content in EFL textbooks should align with the learners' cultural background while exposing them to diverse perspectives. Several studies (Alfarisy, 2021; Jaya et al., 2023; Larasati, 2022) suggest that an ideal English textbook for Indonesian learners should incorporate local cultural references alongside global content. This balance is critical to fostering students' intercultural competence and helping them understand the cultural diversity of the Englishspeaking world.

Moreover, textbooks play a significant role in shaping students' worldview and attitudes toward

different cultures (Hidayah, 2020; Blair, 2023). Studies by Akhmad et al. (2022) and Fitriyani et al. (2021) reveal that the representation of cultural aspects in textbooks can influence students' motivation and engagement in learning. If textbooks lack cultural integration, students might struggle to relate to the material, leading to decreased interest in language acquisition. Thus, a textbook's effectiveness depends not only on linguistic components but also on the cultural narratives it presents.

The table 3 below presents a detailed framework for evaluating the quality of English language textbooks, incorporating pedagogical, linguistic, cultural, and technological aspects.

Aspect	Sub-Aspect	Description
Content Relevance	Curriculum	The textbook should adhere to national and international
	Alignment	curriculum standards, ensuring coherence with expected
		learning outcomes.
	Cognitive	Content should progressively challenge students' cognitive
	Development	abilities, promoting critical thinking, problem-solving, and
-	~	creativity.
Language	Grammatical	Sentence structures, grammar explanations, and exercises
Appropriateness	Complexity	should align with learners' proficiency levels while encouraging linguistic growth.
	Vocabulary Range	Words and phrases should be selected based on frequency,
		relevance, and learners' age groups, with a balance between
		common and academic vocabulary.
Cultural	Local & Global	The textbook should incorporate diverse cultural contexts,
Representation	Perspectives	promoting an inclusive worldview while respecting local
		traditions and values.
	Intercultural	Activities should encourage awareness and sensitivity towards
	Competence	different cultures, fostering tolerance and cross-cultural
		communication skills.
Communicative	Real-life Language	Dialogues, conversations, and practice activities should reflect
Approach Use		authentic language use in social and professional settings.
	Interaction-based	The textbook should integrate pair work, group discussions,
	Learning	role-plays, and collaborative tasks to enhance communicative
Claill Intergration	Balanced Four Skills	competence.
Skill Integration	Balanced Four Skills	The textbook must provide equal emphasis on listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills, avoiding an overemphasis
		on any one skill.
	Higher-Order	Activities should move beyond rote learning, incorporating
	Thinking Skills	analytical, evaluative, and creative tasks.
Textbook Design &	Visual Appeal	Illustrations, infographics, and images should enhance
Layout	, isuai rippeai	comprehension and engagement rather than serve as mere
Lujou		decorations.
	Readability &	Font size, spacing, page structure, and color schemes should be
	Accessibility	designed for ease of reading and inclusivity.
Exercises &	Formative &	The textbook should include a variety of assessments (self-
Assessment	Summative	check quizzes, teacher-led assessments, peer reviews) to track
	Assessment	progress effectively.
	Differentiated	Tasks should be adaptable to students' varying proficiency
	Differentiated Learning	Tasks should be adaptable to students' varying proficiency levels, incorporating scaffolding techniques.

Table 2. Comprehensive framework for evaluating English language textbooks

A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3

Technological	Digital Learning	QR codes, AR/VR experiences, mobile applications, and e-
Integration	Tools	learning platforms should be integrated where applicable.
	Online & Offline	The textbook should support hybrid learning models, ensuring
	Usability	effectiveness in both digital and printed formats.
Teacher & Student	Teacher's Guide &	Supplementary materials, including lesson plans, teaching
Usability	Lesson Plans	strategies, and answer keys, should assist educators in lesson
		delivery.
	Student Engagement	The content should include gamification, project-based
		learning, and self-reflection tasks to motivate learners.

Textbook content and appropriateness

Another crucial aspect of an effective textbook is the appropriateness of its content and language level. The difficulty of a textbook should match students' language proficiency and Mustafa (2021) highlights the significance while challenge and comprehensibility (Li et al., 2020: Pendidikan Kementerian Kebudayaan, 2022). Research by Ambarwati and Mandasari (2020)highlights that textbooks incorporating interactive digital tools, such as online dictionaries, can significantly enhance students' vocabulary and pedagogical alignment with contemporary pronunciation.

Furthermore, textbook evaluation frameworks, such as those proposed by Alkin, Vo, and Christie (2024), suggest that an ideal textbook should provide well-structured exercises. clear explanations, and opportunities for students to apply knowledge in real-life contexts. Studies by Balmer and Damayanti and Kristiantari (2022) and Moris Richards (2022) and Tomlinson (2023) indicate that students learn more effectively when textbooks include meaningful tasks that relate to their everyday experiences. Without real-world relevance, textbooks risk becoming ineffective tools for language acquisition.

Pedagogical approaches and learning strategies

The pedagogical approach embedded in a textbook determines its success in facilitating and Wahana (2023) emphasize the importance learning. Several researchers (Damayanti & Kristiantari, 2022; Dwidarti & Yuliasari, 2024) stress that an effective English textbook encourage peer interaction through group with modern should align methodologies, such as language teaching (CLT) and task-based environment. This interactive component

language learning (TBL). These approaches encourage active student participation and enhance their ability to use the language in authentic contexts.

Additionally, research by Jaya et al. (2023) maintaining a balance between of textbooks integrating 21st-century skills, such as critical thinking, creativity, dan collaboration, and communication. Textbooks designed with these elements allow students to develop competencies that extend beyond language learning. preparing them for academic and professional success. Hence, teaching strategies is essential for a textbook's effectiveness.

Visual and interactive elements

The inclusion of visuals, interactive exercises, and multimedia elements is another critical factor in textbook effectiveness. Studies by et al. (2020) suggest that textbooks with engaging visual elements, such as images, diagrams, and infographics, enhance student comprehension and retention of information. Textbooks that incorporate digital resources, such as QR codes linking to additional materials or online exercises, offer students a more interactive learning experience (Schrire, 2022).

Moreover, findings from Warisno (2022) of collaboration skills and engagement strategies in textbooks. When textbooks teaching discussions and collaborative tasks, they foster communicative a more dynamic and engaging classroom significantly contributes to a student's ability textbooks align with both national and to internalize and apply new language international educational concepts.

Evaluation and continuous improvement

Textbook evaluation and revision play a importance of multiple factors in evaluating crucial role in maintaining high educational standards. Research by Quintão et al. (2020) and Nartin et al. (2024) indicates that pedagogical approaches, visual elements, continuous feedback from teachers and students is vital for improving textbook quality. Effective textbooks undergo periodic updates based on pedagogical research and classroom feedback to ensure they remain relevant to students' needs.

Furthermore, studies by Putri and Priyanti (2023)and Peel (2020) highlight the importance of integrating assessment tools within textbooks. Textbooks should not only provide language input but also include formative and summative assessments that CONCLUSION allow students to monitor their progress. The presence of self-evaluation exercises and teacher-guided assessments ensures that students develop both linguistic and metacognitive skills, reinforcing their learning process.

Alignment with national and international standards

A final crucial aspect of an effective textbook is its alignment with educational standards and curriculum guidelines. The Indonesian government's policies textbook on development (Pemerintah, 2021; Kementerian The findings emphasize the need for educators Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2022) emphasize that English textbooks must adhere to national curriculum requirements while also considering global benchmarks. Research by Suri et al. (2024) and Jaya et al. (2023) highlights that textbooks should be designed in line with the Merdeka Curriculum, ensuring that they foster autonomy, adaptability, and skill development among students.

Internationally. textbook development should consider frameworks such as the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and Content and By addressing these gaps, the study contributes Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) principles (Li et al., 2020; Shi, 2024). When

standards, they provide students with a more comprehensive and globally relevant learning experience.

The findings of this study reaffirm the textbook quality. including cultural representation, content appropriateness, evaluation mechanisms, and alignment with educational standards. The review of literature supports the claim that well-designed textbooks significantly contribute to students' language development and overall learning experience (Mulyasa, 2023; Waruwu, 2024). Future research should explore how these aspects can be further refined to meet the evolving needs of learners in diverse educational contexts.

- This study highlights the strengths and areas for improvement in English textbooks used in Indonesian high schools. The evaluation, based on key criteria such as and approaches, design aims and organization, language content, skills topics development, and cultural representation, and practical considerations, reveals that while some textbooks align well with curriculum standards, others require enhancements in cultural inclusivity, skill integration, and real-world applicability.
- and policymakers to adopt a more selective approach in choosing textbooks that effectively support English language acquisition. Curriculum developers should focus on improving material design to better reflect global standards maintaining local relevance. while Additionally, this study provides a valuable reference for future research on textbook evaluation, particularly in adapting international materials to the Indonesian educational context.
- to the ongoing improvement of English language education in Indonesia, ensuring

A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3

that students receive high-quality learning resources that enhance their linguistic and communicative competencies.

REFERENCES

- Akhmad, E., Saleh, Y. R., & Pakaya, S. (2022). The criteria of good English textbook for students: A senior English textbook analysis. *ELOQUENCE: Journal of Foreign Language*, 1(3), 114-124.
- Alfarisy, F. (2021). Kebijakan pembelajaran bahasa Inggris di Indonesia dalam perspektif pembentukan warga dunia dengan kompetensi antarbudaya. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 6(3), 303-313.
- Alkin, M. C., Vo, A. T., & Christie, C. A. (2024). *Evaluation essentials: From A to Z.* Guilford Publications.
- Ambarwati, R., & Mandasari, B. (2020). The influence of online Cambridge dictionary toward students' pronunciation and vocabulary mastery. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 50-55.
- Ayu, M. (2020). Evaluation cultural content on English textbook used by EFL students in Indonesia. JET (Journal of English Teaching, 6(3), 183-192.
 dissertation, Unika Soegijapranata Semarang].
 Li, L., Huang, F., Chen, S., Pan, L., Zeng, W., & Wu, X. (2020). Exploring the curriculum development
- Balmer, D. F., & Richards, B. F. (2022). Conducting qualitative research through time: How might theory be useful in longitudinal qualitative research? *Advances in Health Sciences Education*, 27(1), 277-288.
- Blair, A. (2023). Writing a textbook is good for you. In *The Palgrave handbook of teaching and research in political science* (pp. 91-99). Springer International Publishing.
- Damayanti, K. D., & Kristiantari, M. G. R. (2022). Multimedia interaktif berbasis aplikasi Android dalam pengenalan bahasa Inggris dasar siswa kelas VI. *Mimbar Ilmu*, 27(1), 81-89.
- Dwidarti, F., & Yuliasari, U. (2024). Implementasi metode pembelajaran bahasa Inggris di SDN Mondokan Tuban: Suatu analisis efektivitas dan tantangan. JEMARI (Jurnal Edukasi Madrasah Ibtidaiyah), 6(2), 65-71.
- Fitriyani, I., Aprianti, F., & Sugesti, I. (2021). An analysis of English textbook entitled "Stop Bullying Now" published by Kemendikbud RI. In National Conference on Language, Education, and Technology Proceeding (Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 102-109).
- Gyamtso, D., & Dukpa, N. (2020). Curriculum development for primary and secondary education. *Notes*, *56*, 28.
- Hidayah, I. (2020). Analisis standar penilaian pendidikan di Indonesia: Telaah atas Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Nomor 20 Tahun 2007, Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Nomor 66 Tahun 2013, dan Peraturan

Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Nomor 23 Tahun 2016. *Al Iman: Jurnal Keislaman dan Kemasyarakatan*, 4(1), 85-105.

- Hidayat, R. A., Purwati, K. L., & Amin, M. Z. (2024). Penerapan Genre-Based Approach pada pembelajaran bahasa Inggris di SDN Ngaliyan 01 Semarang: Analisis Genee dalam buku kurikulum merdeka pada fase B. *DIDAKTIKA: Jurnal Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar*, 7(2).
- Jaya, A., Hartono, R., Syafri, F., & Haryanti, R. P. (2023, June). Analisis tuntutan kurikulum merdeka dalam konteks penerapan keterampilan abad 21 pada materi pembelajaran bahasa Inggris. In *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pascasarjana* (Vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 142-147).
- Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan. (2022). Bahasa Inggris: Work in progress. Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Larasati, M. G. V. (2022). Strategi komunikasi publik oleh hubungan masyarakat (Humas) Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi dalam membangun pemahaman mahasiswa terhadap program "Merdeka Belajar" [Doctoral dissertation, Unika Soegijapranata Semarang].
- Li, L., Huang, F., Chen, S., Pan, L., Zeng, W., & Wu, X. (2020). Exploring the curriculum development in content and language integrated learning: A systematic review. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 9(4), 1102-1113.
- Marhamah, M., Cyntia, C., Wulandari, F., Sarita, R., & Alfitri, A. (2024). Analisis kebutuhan buku teks mata pelajaran bahasa Inggris terintegritas budaya Melayu Riau kelas X SMA Pekanbaru. *Jurnal Onoma: Pendidikan, Bahasa, dan Sastra, 10*(1), 667-679.
- Mezmir, E. A. (2020). Qualitative data analysis: An overview of data reduction, data display, and interpretation. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, *10*(21), 15-27.
- Moris, D., Shaw, B. I., Gloria, J., Kesseli, S. J., Samoylova, M. L., Schmitz, R., & Barbas, A. S. (2020). Textbook outcomes in liver transplantation. *World Journal of Surgery*, 44(10), 3470-3477.
- Mulyasa, H. E. (2023). Implementasi kurikulum merdeka. Bumi Aksara.
- Nainggolan, B. R., & Wirza, Y. (2021, April). Evaluation of an English textbook. In *Thirteenth Conference on Applied Linguistics (CONAPLIN* 2020) (pp. 51-59). Atlantis Press.
- Peel, K. L. (2020). A beginner's guide to applied educational research using thematic analysis. *Practical Assessment, Research, and Evaluation*, 25(1).
- Pemerintah, P. (2021). *Peraturan pemerintah nomor 57 tahun 2021 tentang standar nasional pendidikan.* Jakarta: Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia.

- Putri, N., & Priyanti, R. (2023). Analisis hubungan penguasaan kosakata bahasa Inggris dengan kemampuan membaca siswa. *Karimah Tauhid*, 2(5), 1869-1877.
- Quintão, C., Andrade, P., & Almeida, F. (2020). How to improve the validity and reliability of a case study approach? *Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies in Education*, 9(2), 264-275.
- Qurniati, Q., Dharminto, M., Hoiriyah, E., & Zahara, E. (2022). Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional RI Nomor 27 Tahun 2008 tentang standar kualifikasi akademik dan kompetensi konselor di SMA Bhakti Suci Jaya Tanjung Batu Kabupaten Ogan Ilir. Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Studi Kebijakan (JIASK), 4(2), 97-112.
- Robinson, J. (2024). Likert scale. In Encyclopedia of Quality of Life and Well-Being Research (pp. 3917-3918). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Roosinda, F. W., Lestari, N. S., Utama, A. G. S., Anisah, H. U., Siahaan, A. L. S., Islamiati, S. H. D., & Fasa, M. I. (2021). *Metode penelitian kualitatif.* Zahir Publishing.
- Sakti, D. P. B., Simamora, R. B., Karim, A., Nurmayanti, S., Alhamidi, E. M. A., Abidin, N., & Sinaga, T. M. (2023). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia*. CV. Intelektual Manifes Media.
- Saputra, A. (2020). *CAMI: Aplikasi uji validitas dan reliabilitas instrumen penelitian berbasis web.* Yayasan Ahmar Cendekia Indonesia.
- Sasaghapu, T., Rattu, J. A., & Lotulung, D. R. (2022). Istilah kekerabatan dalam bahasa Inggris dan bahasa Siau (suatu analisis kontrastif). Jurnal Elektronik Fakultas Sastra Universitas Sam Ratulangi, 35.
- Schrire, R. (2022). Learned without book: English grammar schools and the place of textbooks in early modern education. *The Sixteenth Century Journal*, *53*(1), 169-194.
- Sharma, L. R., Jha, S., Koirala, R., Aryal, U., & Bhattarai, T. (2023). Navigating the research landscape: A guide to the selection of the right

research design. International Research Journal of MMC (IRJMMC), 4(1), 64-78.

- Shi, X. (2024). Effective strategies and teaching methods for developing practical English skills. *The Educational Review*, 8(4), 531-535.
- Simamora, M. W. B., & Oktaviani, L. (2020). What is your favorite movie?: A strategy of English education students to improve English vocabulary. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 44-49.
- Solangi, N. A., & Memon, S. A. (2020). Evaluation of 'English for Undergraduates'-A coursebook for English language teaching at University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan from teachers' perspective.
- Subagyo, A., & Ip, S. (2020). Aplikasi metode riset: Praktik penelitian kualitatif, kuantitatif & mix methods. Inteligensia Media.
- Suri, M., Fajriati, R., Mutiawati, M., & Mursyida, C. S. (2024). Analisis kurikulum dan implementasi pembelajaran bahasa Inggris pada lembaga pendidikan non-formal di Banda Aceh. *Journal of Education Science*, 10(2), 21-32.
- Suttrisno, S., Istiani, N., & Habibulloh, M. R. (2022). Analisis manajemen program bahasa Inggris kelas unggulan di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *IBTIDA'*, *3*(2), 130-141.
- Tomlinson, B. (Ed.). (2023). *Developing materials for language teaching*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Wahana, G. M. (2023). Collaboration skills in English textbook entitled "Bahasa Inggris Think Globally Act Locally" for 9th grade students: A content analysis (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Negeri Jakarta).
- Warisno, A. (2022). Konsep mutu pembelajaran dan faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhinya. *Attractive: Innovative Education Journal*, 4(1), 310-322.
- Waruwu, M. (2024). Pendekatan penelitian kualitatif: Konsep, prosedur, kelebihan, dan peran di bidang pendidikan. *Afeksi: Jurnal Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 5(2), 198-211.
- Yonata, F., & Yoniswan, Y. (2021). Stereotip karakter perempuan dalam buku ajar untuk sekolah dasar: Kajian multimodalitas. *Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, 9(2), 111-121.

A comparative review of english textbooks for tenth-grade students 'Bahasa Inggris: Work in Progress' and 'English in Mind book 3